

Argyll and Bute Council
Comhairle Earra-Ghàidheal Agus Bhòid

Customer Services
Executive Director: Douglas Hendry



Kilmory, Lochgilphead, PA31 8RT
Tel: 01546 602127 Fax: 01546 604435
DX 599700 LOCHGILPHEAD

22 March 2019

SUPPLEMENTARY PACK 1

PLANNING, PROTECTIVE SERVICES AND LICENSING COMMITTEE - MAIN HALL, QUEENS HALL, ARGYLL STREET, DUNOON on TUESDAY, 26 MARCH 2019 at 9:30 AM

I enclose herewith **supplementary report number 2** for **item 3** on the Agenda for the above meeting.

Douglas Hendry
Executive Director of Customer Services

SUPPLEMENTARY REPORT

- 3. ARDTARAIG WINDFARM LTD: ERECTION OF WIND FARM COMPRISING 7 WIND TURBINES WITH A MAXIMUM TIP HEIGHT OF 136.5M WITH ASSOCIATED INFRASTRUCTURE AND 4 BORROW PITS: ARDTARAIG WIND FARM, 3.1KM TO THE EAST OF GLENDARUEL AND APPROX. 15KM WEST OF DUNOON, LOCH STRIVEN, ARGYLL (REF: 18/01516/PP)**

Report by Head of Planning, Housing and Regulatory Services (Pages 3 – 8)

Planning, Protective Services and Licensing Committee

Councillor Gordon Blair	Councillor Rory Colville (Vice-Chair)
Councillor Robin Currie	Councillor Mary-Jean Devon
Councillor Lorna Douglas	Councillor Audrey Forrest
Councillor George Freeman	Councillor Graham Hardie
Councillor David Kinniburgh (Chair)	Councillor Donald MacMillan
Councillor Roderick McCuish	Councillor Jean Moffat
Councillor Alastair Redman	Councillor Sandy Taylor
Councillor Richard Trail	

Contact: Fiona McCallum

Tel. No. 01546 604392

This page is intentionally left blank

Argyll and Bute Council

Development and Infrastructure Services

Delegated or Committee Planning Application Report and Report of handling as required by Schedule 2 of the Town and Country Planning (Development Management Procedure) (Scotland) Regulations 2013 relative to applications for Planning Permission or Planning Permission in Principle

Reference No: 18/01516/PP

Planning Hierarchy: Major Application

Applicant: Ardtaraig Windfarm Ltd

Proposal: Erection of wind farm comprising 7 wind turbines with a maximum tip height of 136.5m with associated infrastructure and 4 borrow pits

Site Address: Ardtaraig Wind Farm, 3.1Km to the East of Glendaruel and Approx. 15Km West Of Dunoon, Loch Striven, Argyll and Bute

SUPPLEMENTARY REPORT NO. 2

1.0 INTRODUCTION

This Supplementary report relates to the Ardtaraig Report of Handling dated 11th January 2019. It seeks to update Members on the representations which have been received/withdrawn since preparation of the original report, and the matters which they raise.

2.0 REPRESENTATIONS

15 additional letters of objection have been received since the proposal was first reported to Committee (these including a letter of objection from Councillor Alan Reid), a letter has been received from Fay Harrison withdrawing a letter of representation, and a letter has been received from Shian Carlow requesting to speak in support of the proposal at the Public Hearing. In light of this, the revised totals are as follows: a total of 377 letters have been received, comprising 315 Objections, 56 in support and 4 general representations. The additional letters are tabled below:

- | | | | | | |
|----|------------|------------------------------------|------------------------|--|-----------|
| 1. | Nigel Sim | Anchorage
Tighnabruaich,
7DX | House,
Argyll, PA21 | 21 st January 2019
(14.53) | Objection |
| 2. | Nigel Sim | Anchorage
Tighnabruaich,
7DX | House,
Argyll, PA21 | 21 st January 2019
(14.54) | Objection |
| 3. | Joshua Sim | Anchorage | House, | 21 st January 2019 | Objection |

		Tighnabruaich, Argyll, PA21 7DX	(14.54)		
4.	Joshua Sim	Anchorage House, Tighnabruaich, Argyll, PA21 7DX	21 st January 2019 (14.57)	Objection	
5.	Johanne Sim	Anchorage House, Tighnabruaich, Argyll, PA21 7DX	21 st January 2019 (14.51)	Objection	
6.	Johanne Sim	Anchorage House, Tighnabruaich, Argyll, PA21 7DX	21 st January 2019 (14.52)	Objection	
7.	Johanne Sim	Anchorage House, Tighnabruaich, Argyll, PA21 7DX	21 st January 2019 (14.55)	Objection	
8.	George Kidd	15 Cromwell Street, Dunoon, PA23 7AU	21 st January 2019	Objection	
9.	Councillor Alan Reid	136 Fairhaven, Kirn, Dunoon, Argyll & Bute, PA23 8NS	22 nd January 2019	Objection	
10.	Arthur Grant	2, Stronafian, PA22 3AJ	21 st January 2019	Objection	
11.	Monica Haran	Via email – address not provided	2 nd February 2019	Objection	
12.	Collin Adams	5 Clyde Street, Kirn, PA23 8DX	10 th February 2019	Objection	
13.	Brian Carpenter	Via email – address not provided	12 th February 2019	Objection	
14.	Colin McAllister	Flat 1, 140 South Street, St Andrews, Fife, KY16 9EQ	26 th February 2019	Objection	
15.	Thomas David Lewis	52A Shore Road, Innellan, Dunoon, PA23 7TH	13 th March 2019	Objection	
1.	Shian Carlow	Via email - address not provided	19 th March 2019	General request to speak in support	
1.	Fay Harrison	3 Top Lodge, Saxondale Drive, Upper Saxondale, Nottingham, NG12 2JL	19 th March 2019	Withdrawal of representation	

Councillor Alan Reid objects to the application for the following reasons:

- Councillor Alan Reid – as a Councillor for this ward, I write to object to this application for the following reasons. I agree with SNH’s conclusion that the proposal would have an adverse effect on the special qualities and integrity of

the Kyles of Bute National Scenic Area. I also note that SNH, with their professional expertise, believe there is no way of mitigating against these adverse impacts. These wind turbines will be clearly visible from the National Scenic Area and are of such a large size and scale that they are bound to deter tourists from visiting. I am generally in favour of wind farms and other forms of renewable energy, but these must be sited in places where they will not impact adversely on the tourist industry which is vital to our local economy. Argyll & Bute needs more people and more jobs, but a wind farm of this scale in this location will make our area less attractive to tourists and so mean less local jobs. This application is contrary to Scottish Government and policy and guidance and Local Development Plan Policy. I hope the Committee will reject it.

All other matters of concern raised in all other letters of objection are summarised below:

- *The proposal will have a detrimental impact to tourism and wildlife in an area of outstanding natural beauty.*
- *We don't need it, we don't want it and it is arrogant of both the builder and the land owner to propose to dump this eyesore on Ardtaraig. If the company love them so much let them build in their own area of GB instead of trying to destroy our beautiful countryside.*
- *In support of "No Ardtaraig Wind Farm" 7 massive turbines. 4 quarries. Miles of cables and trenching. The whole of Glen Lean turned over to infrastructure i.e. buildings, roads, power supplies etc. Propaganda for 'Green Energy' dismisses the wholesale destruction of wonderful green lands and the disruption to the inhabitants. I agree with the arguments put forward by NAW. Tourism is vital to the area with people returning year on year and some choosing to retire to Cowal, this tranquil, beautiful environment must be treasured. How many tourists revisit e.g. Whitelaw wind farm? The cost of this proposal in monetary terms must be immense, the return negligible. The irreplaceable damage to this whole area would be incalculable.*
- *Given the income from tourism that this area benefits from, the idea that this is of any economic benefit must surely be short sighted in the extreme. This is a National Scenic Area and with there being no landscape view of Loch Fyne left that is not blighted by turbines, surely the accumulative effect of yet another in this beautiful sight is a step too far. The idea that pumping thousands of gallons of concrete into the hillside is somehow ecologically safe I have to say I find breath taking in its naivety. Please let common sense prevail for once and have the developers put these things where they won't so adversely affect the landscape, the ecology or our tourism industry.*
- *I have been visiting Scotland from my home in Australia since 1981, having visited 6 times in the last 10 years and will again visit your beautiful Country in May 2019. It came as a shock to discover that the above proposed wind farm is to be built on the magnificent Loch Fyne, an area I visit regularly. Scotland is a wonderful country with a unique culture and incredible scenery. Over the last decade or so your landscape has been scarred by a multitude of wind farms*

and although I support “green energy” it is imperative that is not at the cost of vandalising your heritage. In this particular instance that is exactly what is being proposed. I am sure a majority of Scots must feel the same so as an international visitor I believe I speak for the majority of tourist and request that this proposal be rejected to preserve this wonderful area.

- *I have just returned from an enjoyable trip to Cowal. I was horrified to see proposals for a huge wind farm at the Kyles of Bute. Is there to be nowhere in Scotland safe from these monstrosities? I object most strongly to the desecration of our beautiful landscapes. Wind farms are eyesores, inefficient and very expensive ways of capturing energy and hit the poorest hardest.*
- *I very strongly feel that I must register my objection, complete disapproval, extreme concern and repudiation that these items are even being considered for installation in an area possessing such natural beauty in the Cowal region. From many standpoints they are not suitable for installation in the area being proposed, which will seriously impact in a wholly unacceptable fashion on the landscapes, wildlife (birds and other species), notwithstanding probable and undesirable health issues, which are being evidenced and highlighted by specialists, these also allied to the anticipated devaluation of any properties which may in any way be in proximity to this proposed eyesore. How is it even remotely conceivable for local Government to be trying to promote the region as a tourist destination, based of course on the natural beauty of the surrounding areas and countryside, and thereafter even remotely contemplate a proposal to allow these visually horrific and obscene items to be installed in an area of such natural beauty, quite frankly beggars belief, and which would surely impact most negatively on the local tourist industry as a result, which needs all the help and assistance it can get, to promote and secure much needed employment and promote a stable and sustainable economic future for the region. Currently installed turbines, which are visually horrific and obscene, already provide a taste of what is to come on many landscapes throughout the country, and which may be seen from large distances on land or air, especially wherever travelling about Central Scotland. Whilst in no way rejecting the need for both cleaner and sustainable energy, alternative solutions must of course be found and implemented, but in this case in particular I do feel that other alternatives could and should be explored to offer a viable substitute, perhaps an off-shore installation or similar given that these would not impact the beautiful and dramatic countryside we are so privileged to live in and around. I do sincerely hope that this particular project will not receive government’s approval to be allowed to proceed, seriously blighting the surrounding countryside in the region.*

3.0 CONSULTEES

Kilmun Community Council (8th February 2019) – confirmed that they are remaining neutral and are therefore not making any objection to the application.

Kilmun Community Council (8th February 2019) – provide clarification as to why they are remaining neutral, which is on the basis of the lack of objections made to them,

4.0 NOTE

This page is intentionally left blank